

**Town of Hilton Head Island
Design Review Board
Minutes of the Tuesday, October 22, 2013 Meeting
1:15p.m – Benjamin M. Racusin Council Chambers**

APPROVED

Board Members Present: Chairman Scott Sodemann, Vice Chairman Deborah Welch, Jennifer Moffett, Tom Parker, Todd Theodore, and Galen Smith

Board Members Absent: Jake Gartner

Town Council Present: Bill Harkins

Town Staff Present: Jennifer Ray, Urban Designer
Heather Colin, Development Review Administrator
Jayme Lopko, Senior Planner; Nicole Dixon, Senior Planner
Brian Hulbert, Staff Attorney
Teri Lewis, LMO Official
Kathleen Carlin, Administrative Assistant

1. Call to Order

Chairman Scott Sodemann called the meeting to order at 1:15p.m.

2. Roll Call

3. Freedom of Information Act Compliance

4. Approval of the Agenda

Ms. Ray reported that within the past 24-hours three applicants have requested that their applications be removed from today's agenda: (1) Application for Appeal APL130007, Bennali's Sandal & Hat Company, has decided not to contest the decision on the signs; (2) Hilton Head Zaxby's, DR130044, has requested that their application be placed on a future agenda due to working out some legal issues regarding the property; and (3) The Beach House, DR130042, their ARB approval letter was not received by the staff in time for placement on today's agenda. This application will appear on the Board's November 12th agenda.

The Board **approved** the agenda as revised by general consent.

5. Approval of the Minutes

The Board **approved** the minutes of the October 8, 2013 meeting as presented by general consent.

6. Staff Report

None

7. Board Business

None

8. Unfinished Business

None

9. New Business

A. New Development - Final

Hilton Head Plantation Telecommunications Facility – DR130032

Ms. Ray introduced the application and stated its location, 68 Dolphin Head Drive. This project received Conceptual approval by the Board on September 10, 2013.

Ms. Ray presented an in-depth overhead review of the Final review application including aerial photos of the site. The aerial photos show the locations of Dolphin Head Drive, White Tail Deer Lane, single-family residential, and Dolphin Head Golf Course holes # 11 and # 1.

The site is mostly wooded with tall pines and saw palmettos. The applicant proposes to install a stealth monopine tower, 140-ft. in height. The site plan shows access from Dolphin Head Drive via 14-ft. asphalt road. This is a change from gravel on the Conceptual submittal. Plans include a 39 x 60-ft. gravel compound with a wood fence surrounding the compound. The wood fence will be a minimum of 10-ft. tall. The 140-ft. tall monopine tower will be located inside the fenced compound.

The existing leisure trail is proposed to be relocated behind the tower. Per the Board's comments at the last meeting, the radius at the transitions from the existing trail into the new trail has been softened. The elevation indicates the 140-ft. monopine tower to be painted a dark brown. There is an option to add a bark type material to the pole with the intent that it will blend in with the existing pine trees.

The details show the wood board fence, 10' minimum, intended to screen the buildings inside the compound. The fence will be painted a Nantucket Grey per a condition of the Hilton Head Plantation's ARB. FCC regulations do require certain signage including 'private property', 'no trespassing', and the FCC registration number. These signs will be located outside of the compound. The signs are listed under the incidental sign category and are under 4-ft. in size.

Ms. Ray reviewed the applicant's landscape plan. The existing pines, palmetto palms, and hardwood trees will remain. The applicant has added additional landscaping on the open space side of the pathway as previously requested by the Board. The new plant material will be installed at a large size. The palmetto palms will be a minimum of 4-ft. tall and the pines will be installed at a minimum of 8-ft. tall.

Ms. Ray reviewed the elevations showing the proposed building. The building is located inside the fence and will not be visible unless someone is inside the compound. Ms. Ray reviewed a photo showing what the faux pine branches are intended to look like. The pine branches are on poles 5 - 6 ft. long. Ms. Ray distributed hard samples of the proposed bark material, the pebble finish, and the wood fence color for the Board's review.

Ms. Ray stated the Hilton Head Plantation ARB has approved the application with the condition that the installed wood fence be painted Nantucket Grey and that the plant material be installed at a large size.

Ms. Ray briefly reviewed the public comments that have been received by staff. The staff has received 316 letters in favor of the project and 17 letters in opposition. One of the letters in opposition includes a petition with 57 signatures. The staff recommended that the application be approved as submitted. Following staff's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested that

the applicant make his presentation.

Mr. Terry Thomas, E. M. Enterprises Contractors, Inc. presented statements in support of the application. Mr. Parker and Mr. Thomas discussed the color of the faux bark. The applicant stated the faux bark can be tinted any color to match the existing pines. All of the Board members stated that they like the project. Following the applicant's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested public comments. The following residents presented statements in opposition to the application:

(1) Mr. Jim Scheider presented statements in opposition on behalf of a number of property owners living 100-150-ft. of the project; (2) Mr. Brad Wainwright; (3) Ms. Elaine Genson; (4) Mr. Jeffrey Kaplan; (5) Mr. David Premo; and (6) Ms. Lynn Moss presented statements in opposition based on the 100-ft. notification requirements, the affected parties living outside of the 100-ft. notification requirement, and the negative impact on property values.

Chairman Sodemann reported that the Design Review Board has jurisdiction over only the aesthetics of a project. The Design Review Board has no jurisdiction over land uses or POA covenants.

Mr. Parker asked Ms. Ray to clarify the submittal requirements for the Final review of this application. Ms. Ray described the submittal requirements for the Final review of an application and stated the requirements for the Final review of this project were met.

Following public comments, Chairman Sodemann requested comments from the Board. All of the Board members stated that they like the project. At the completion of comments by the Board, Chairman Sodemann requested that a motion be made.

Mr. Parker made a **motion** to **approve** the Hilton Head Plantation Telecommunications Facility application, DR130032, with the condition that the faux bark be painted a grey color that will match the existing pine trees. Mr. Smith **seconded** the motion and the motion **passed** with a vote of 6-0-0.

B. New Development – Conceptual

(Mr. Theodore recused himself from review of the following application, Harbour Town Golf Clubhouse, due to a professional conflict of interest. A Conflict of Interest Form was completed, signed by Mr. Theodore, and attached to the record.)

Harbour Town Golf Clubhouse – DR130041

Ms. Ray introduced the application and stated its location, 11 Lighthouse Lane. The objective of the Sea Pines Resort is to create a world class clubhouse for golf patrons as well as resort guest and residents. The Harbour Town Golf Course is ranked the second highest by PGA players as their most favorite course behind Augusta National, and is consistently ranked in the top 25 courses in the country. A golf course of such high quality needs to be complemented with a clubhouse facility of equal quality and amenities.

Ms. Ray presented an in-depth overhead review of the application. The photos show neighboring uses and architectural styles including the Inn at Harbour Town, the Sea Pines Racquet Club, the Lighthouse Promenade and the adjacent villas, the Harbour Town Yacht Basin, and the adjacent villas.

The survey shows the existing Clubhouse, the Conference Center, the practice green, the drop off, the parking, and the Inn. Ms. Ray reviewed the applicant's plan showing the buildings in relationship to each other (the Inn, the Conference Center, the Clubhouse, and the Lighthouse).

The site analysis prepared shows key features such as significant trees as well as pedestrian and vehicular circulation.

The design of the new Clubhouse is intended to capture the spirit and history of the Heritage Golf Tournament. The “golfers’ entry” is located on the east end making it convenient and inviting for Inn guests as well as for golfers arriving via car. The main entry is located on the north side of the building and is on axis with the Lighthouse. The existing Clubhouse axis and alignment to the Lighthouse has not only been maintained but enhanced and celebrated in the design of the new clubhouse.

The plan provides a formal drop-off zone as well as a gentleman’s plaza. The plaza extends beyond the drop-off, opening into the plaza and cart staging area. Also included is an event lawn that can be viewed from the Clubhouse and used during special events. Parking has been modified slightly between the Clubhouse and the Inn, and also replaces two of the existing tennis courts for additional parking.

The entry at Lighthouse Lane is proposed to have a raised pedestrian crossing where the Trolley stops. The Promenade will include a new boardwalk with enhanced landscaping and seating. The proposed three-story structure includes a golf cart garage and storage at the ground level, a pro-shop, women’s locker room, restaurant, private dining, toilet rooms, and kitchen and back-of-house activities on the main floor; and men’s/Pro’s locker room, multi-function rooms, toilet rooms, and back-of-house on the upper floor.

The existing Conference Center roof will be removed and replaced with a new slate roof that better complements the new Clubhouse. The exterior stucco on the Conference Center will be removed and replaced with materials to match the new Clubhouse.

The proposed new Clubhouse exterior materials are intended to compliment the context of Harbour Town and the overall Sea Pines community as well as evoke a sense of timeless tradition. Cement-based scored stucco will be used on the ground and main floors. The upper floor will be covered with a shell-impregnated stucco with a cast stone band separating the upper and lower floors. In addition to the band, cast stone will be used on the window and door trim, columns and bases. Wood windows will be clad in a color to match the cast stone trim. Exterior doors will be stained mahogany. The main roof material will be a Vermont slate and the accent roofs will be covered in copper with a verde finish.

Ms. Ray reviewed details of the elevations. The architecture and landscaped environment is intended to portray an understated richness and patina found in classic golf clubhouses. Wide expanse of windows allow an abundance of natural light into the interior spaces while providing amazing views out to the golf course. Covered porches on the main and upper floors allow patrons to enjoy being outside, while being protected from the elements. The main floor patio will accommodate outdoor seating for the restaurant patrons or an inviting place for gathering.

The Sea Pines ARB has issued a preliminary approval with the conditions that the applicant restudy the scale and proportions of the handrails so they read as very substantial plus the horizontal bands should be more substantial.

The staff recommends approval of this Conceptual application as submitted. Following the staff’s presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested that the applicant make his presentation.

Mr. Cliff McMackin, Director of Resort Development, Sea Pines Resort, presented statements in support of the application. The applicant presented comments regarding the timeline for the project.

Mr. Smith, Ms Moffett and Vice Chairman Welch stated that they like the project and complimented the architectural elements.

Mr. Parker and Mr. Grady Woods, architect for the project, discussed details of the metal roof. The applicant intends to use real copper in a pre-patina finish. The slate will be real in a grey-based color.

Chairman Sodemann stated that he thinks the handrails look nice. They should be consistent with the porch handrails of the Conference Center.

Chairman Sodemann and Ms. Kristen Mansfield, Wood + Partners, briefly reviewed the landscaping plan for the project. The landscape plan will be submitted at Final review of the project. Following final comments by the Board, Chairman Sodemann requested that a motion be made.

Vice Chairman Welch made a motion to **approve** the Harbour Town Golf Clubhouse application, DR130041, as submitted. Ms. Moffett **seconded** the motion and the motion **passed** with a vote of 5-0-0.

C. Alteration/Addition

The Fidelity Building – DR 130043

Ms. Ray introduced the application and stated its location, 807 William Hilton Parkway, in the Plantation Center. The applicant is proposing to install an elevator at the existing building. Ms. Ray presented an in-depth overhead review of the application including site photos and elevations.

The site photos show existing conditions and location of the proposed addition. The location was chosen due to convenience of parking and existing stairway to the second floor. The project will have limited impact on the site with no changes to existing parking or lighting and only marginal changes to existing landscape.

One tree and a few shrubs will need to be removed to accommodate the addition. The survey shows existing conditions. The site plan shows the location of the addition in the front corner of the building, adjacent to the existing stair entry to the second floor.

A model story of four perspective views was prepared indicating the new pit and stair openings, the elevation equipment, the elevator massing study, and a roof perspective. The design is intended to match the existing size, scale, and finishes of the existing structure. The staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that a landscape plan indicating the proposed changes be submitted for review and approval. Following the staff's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested that the applicant make his presentation.

Mr. Dan Ogden, D. L. Ogden Architecture, LLC, presented statements in support of the application. The applicant stated the addition of the new two-story elevation will be an important feature in attracting tenants to the facility as well as providing barrier-free access to the existing second floor. The design is intended to match the existing size, scale and finish of the existing structure in order to maintain an appropriate context for this type of facility and surrounding neighborhood. Following the applicant's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested comments from the Board.

Mr. Smith presented statements regarding the need for additional landscaping at the front of the building. Ms. Moffett agreed with Mr. Smith's comments regarding landscaping requirements.

Mr. Theodore and Vice Chairman Welch agreed with the comments presented so far by the Board. Mr. Parker recommended that additional design be given to the front of the building. The current submission does not seem to meet the intent of the Design Guide. The creation of a third element would help the project. Mr. Parker and the applicant discussed the recommended design addition.

Chairman Sodemann agreed with the concerns presented by Mr. Parker. There is something

that can be done to bring an element to the project besides a stucco rectangle. An architectural quality seems to be missing from the project right now.

Following final comments by the Board, the applicant stated that he would like to *withdraw* the application for additional study. The applicant will resubmit the project at a later date.

D. Minor External Change

Tidepointe Entry Landscaping – DR 130045

Ms. Ray introduced the application and stated the location, 700 Tidepointe Way. Ms. Ray presented an in-depth overhead review of the application including aerial photos of the site. The site includes 57 cottages, 10 verandas, 2 villas, the clubhouse, and the care center.

The applicant proposes to renovate the 60 acre site by using native/prevalent landscape material, adding aquatic plants at lagoon edges, considering views from villa windows, and massing flowers in strategically placed beds. The first phase will focus on entrance with other phases to follow over several years. The site photos show existing conditions at the entrance, along Tidepointe Way, the spa, the clubhouse, the villas, the care center, courtyards, verandas and cottages. Ms. Ray reviewed the areas that are scheduled for improvements.

The main entrance area is currently heavily wooded. Many of the existing pines will be removed (a significant portion of them are poor specimens with defects). The trees will be replaced with highly value species.

The applicant plans to retain the existing plants to the extent possible with some flexibility toward an aesthetically pleasing overall design. The plant material will be native to the extent possible. The plant material will be low maintenance, sustainable, and ecologically fitting for the area. The lagoons will be planted at their edges with appropriate aquatic plants such as grasses, blue flag iris, lizard tail, and pickerelweed. Along Tidepointe Way the applicant plans to clean up the understory, remove vines and small trees and add azaleas, camellia, saw palms, grasses and ground cover. The applicant plans to improve the entrance to cottages and verandas at Freshwater Lane.

Ms. Ray reviewed the trees that are scheduled for removal. The applicant plans to replace the overgrown vegetation and overgrown hedges. The applicant plans to make improvements in parking. The staff recommended approval of the application. Following the staff's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested that the applicant make his presentation.

Mr. David Chidboy, Director of Engineering for Tidepointe, presented statements in support of the application.

The applicant and the Board discussed several issues including the selection of plant material and the removal of trees. Following the applicant's presentation, Chairman Sodemann requested comments from the Board.

Mr. Theodore stated that some of the plant palette is more ornamental rather than native. The applicant should be careful with plants that are attractive to deer. The other Board members stated that they like the plan. Chairman Sodemann and the applicant discussed the timeframe for the project. Following final comments by the Board, Chairman Sodemann requested that a motion be made.

Mr. Theodore made a **motion** to **approve** the Tidepointe Entry Landscaping application, DR 130045, as submitted. Mr. Smith **seconded** the motion and the motion **passed** with a vote of 6-0-0.

10. Appearance by Citizens

None

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:30p.m.

Submitted By:

Approved By:

November 12, 2013

Kathleen Carlin
Administrative Assistance

Scott Sodemann
Chairman